





Global HTA movement: the battle for sustainable UHC

Tokyo, December 2019

Kalipso Chalkidou, MD, PhD

Professor of Practice in Global Health, Imperial College London Director of Global Health Policy and Senior Fellow, Center for Global Development Director, international Decision Support Initiative Health spending is too often insufficient, inefficient and inequitable

June 2019



More money does not always buy you more health...

Figure 14: Maternal mortality and public expenditure on health, deviations from estimates based on per capita income (2011 PPP), 2014



International Monetary Fund, World Economic Outlook Database, April 2016. WHO, UNICEF, UNFPA, The World Bank, and the United Nations Population Division. Trends in Maternal Mortality: 1990 to 2015. Geneva, World Health Organization, 2015. All data extracted using wbopendata in Stata





...and UHC can end up subsidising providers and neglecting the neediest: the case of Indonesia

BPJS is collecting premiums in some of the poorest parts of Indonesia

Percent of district population registered with BPJS in district. Indonesia 2014



Where health needs are the greatest, but...

Health status index, by district, Indonesia 2013



... and spending them in the richest parts of Indonesia

Average BPJS claims paid for inpatient services, per registered BPJS participant.Indonesia 2014



Hospitals non existent...



Reproduced from Elizabeth Pisano analysis, 2018



ource: Ministry of Health. Mapping: Pisani, Pratiwi, Setiyaningsil



pect. 2015;29(1):139-62

reported, and discounted 12%. IFN = interferon.

The cost of multiple sclerosis drugs in the US and the pharmaceutical industry

BMJ 2019;366:I4340 doi: 10.1136/bmj.I4340 (Published 10 July 2019)

relevant outcomes in a randomised controlled trial or very large benefit in a non-randomised trial)

Without strong evidence-informed demand, healthcare can make people poor.

40 million Indian people fall into poverty every year due to medical costs, mostly drugs

China moving in the right direction





The Need for Priority Setting: Health systems everywhere are under pressure...







Health Technology Assessment

Taking off as a means of assessing value from the payer's and the population's perspective World Health Assembly resolution on Health Intervention and Technology Assessment, 2014

The WHA urges member states: "to integrate health intervention and technology assessment concepts and principles into relevant strategies and areas...including, but not limited to, universal health coverage, health financing, access to and rational use of quality-assured medicines, vaccines and other health technologies, the prevention and management of non-communicable and communicable diseases, mother and child care, and the formulation of evidencebased health policy"



"Evidence helps when **negotiating price and rules on reimbursement**, which in turn affect access. Health technology assessment is a routine part of the decision-making process for adding medicines to the national benefit package in Thailand, and other countries such as Indonesia and India are introducing this approach."

FINAL-SOMHD ENDORSED

Theme 1: ENTITLEMENT/ACCESS TO AFFORDABLE PACKAGE OF GOODS AND SERVICES (end-user perspective)

Program Strategy and sub strategy	Programme/Project Activities from 2016 to 2020 (Proposed by Cluster)	Expected Outputs and Indicators	Lead Country	Source of Support		
Achieve best value for money through Health Technology Assessment (HTA)	1. CAPACITY BUILDING ON HEALTH TECHNOLOGY ASSESSMENT					
	1.1 Country Assessment of HTA Capacity Gaps	Expected output: Country Assessment of HTA by 2020 IndicatorsNumber of country assessed Number of advocacy materials developed Advocacy plans to address the gaps developed	Thailand Malaysia Philippines	Partners of HITAP International		
	1.2 Capacity Building based on Country Assessment (workshops, internships and conferences, and partnerships with academic institution)	 Expected output: Regional capacity building plan and activities Country capacity building plan and activities A generic training module on HTA that can be adapted by all ASEAN countries developed 				
		 Indicators: Capacity building plan by 2018 Trainings held and number of trainees by 2019 				



5 Step-HTA process



HTA is becoming a major tool for priority setting and price negotiations for national governments in committed to UHC...

National Health Insurance Act of 2013. Section 11- Excluded Personal Health Services **Philippines**: "The Corporation shall not cover expenses for health services which the Corporation and the DOH consider cost-ineffective through health technology assessment..."

Indonesia: Minister of Health's Decree No. 71 /2013 Article 34

(5)Health Technology Assessment Committee provide policv recommendation to the Minister on the feasibility of the health service as referred to in paragraph (4) to be included as benefit package of National Health Insurance

"the India Medical Technology Assessment Board for evaluation and appropriateness effectiveness of the available a Technologies in India...standarc



interventions that will reduce the cost and variations in care, expenditure on medical equipment...overall cost of treatment, reduction in out of pocket expenditure of patients...'. Ref: MTAB, Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Government of India





Health Technology



REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA NATIONAL HEALTH INSURANCE BILL national treasury Department National Treasury REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA

(4) Treatment must not be funded if a health care medical necessity exists for the health care service in question; (b) **no cost-effective** intervention exists for the health care service as determined by a health technology assessment; or (c) the health care product or treatment is not included in the Formulary, except in circumstances where a complementary list has been approved by the Minister HTA unit budgeted @R368m in 2018 budget by country's Treasury

Message from the Hon. Minister of State (MoHFW)





MESSAGE

) 315 369/2018 स्वास्थ्य एवं परिवार कल्याण राज्य मंत्रं भारत सरकार MINISTER OF STATE FOR HEALTH & FAMILY WELFARE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA



Health Technology essment in India (H

Stakeholders

Health Technology Assessment (HTA) is a form of policy research that examines short- and long-term consequences of the application of a health-care technology. Prime objective of HTA is to ensure value for money to the patients, efficient utilization of the resources and ensure that the actual benefit of innovations reaches to the patients. HTA can solve numerous medical queries and problems for example cardiovascular problems can be resolved by various techniques like reduction of stress at workplace, cessation of smoking or heart by-pass surgeries.

Recognizing the importance of HTA in health services design, management, and delivery of health system, the Government of India has established the Health Technology Assessment in India (HTAIN) with a view to providing the maximum utilization of health care benefits to people.

Our achievements in various fields like **life expectancy**, **infant & maternal mortality rate**, accessibility of healthcare services in rural areas, intensive health campaigns, sanitation devices and increase in number of Government **& private hospitals etc** are significant. Improvement in immunization coverage and literacy rate, have improved the overall health of the country. But, the factors like, less health insurance coverage, large number of population lying in the low income group and High bills of medical care for long term disease are of great concern. The majority of healthcare spending in India, is out of pocket (OOP) (82.2%), 74.7% of which is spent on medicines. Many patients in India have been forced below the poverty line due to healthcare expenditure. Set against this backdrop, only 3 - 5% of Indians are covered under any form of health insurance.

I am confident that HTAIN will be a transparent, effective and systematic and unbiased system, which will be able to accelerate the process of providing access to new research and development to the patients and lead to 100% utilization of existing resources.

Outcome Report on "Health Technology Assessment of Intraocular Lenses for treatment of Age-related Cataracts in India"

"The benefit packages for Phacoemulsification with foldable lens and small incision cataract surgery with rigid PMMA lenses may cost as 9606 INR and 7405 INR respectively"

Health Technology Assessment in India (HTAIn) Secretariat, Department of Health Research, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare

> July-2018 New Delhi



(Anupriva Patel)

Making HTA the Law of the Land: The India HTA Board Act (draft)



	THE HEALTH TECHNOLOGY ASSESSMENT BOARD ACT 2019	
	AN	
	ACT	
	to provide for the constitution of a Board for providing evidences related to cost-effectiveness, clinical- effectiveness and safety of medicines, devices, vaccines and health programmes by means of Health Technology Assessment (HTA) studies for decision making. It will evaluate affordability, appropriateness and cost effectiveness of the available and new health technologies in India. It will work on the objectives of maximizing health, reducing out of pocket expenditure and reducing inequality so that maximum people can have access to quality healthcare at minimum cost in the country.	
	BE it enacted by Parliament in the Seventieth Year of the Republic of India as follows:-	
CHAPTER I PRELIMINARY		
45 /4	1. (1) This Act may be called the Health Technology Assessment Board Act ,2019	Short title, extent and commencement.
15/1	(2) It extends to the whole of India	

7(1) The Board will be a National Advisory Body for providing robust evidence for decision making on

(i)Health Technologies and Interventions

(ii)Clinical ,public health, social care guidelines

(iii)Quality evaluation in health and Social sector

for implementation in public health and social care sectors in Central and State Governments



Welcome To The He

To facilitate the process of transparent and evidence informed decis Health Technology Assessment in India (HTAIn) under the Departr generate evidence related to the clinical effectiveness, cost-effective

generate evidence related to the clinical effectiveness, cost-effectiveness, and salety or medicines, devices and median programs doing the median residence y, accounting

HTA in Thailand: \$768 Million Dollars Saved within 5 Years





Threshold analysis for price of oxaliplatin

Use of HITA information in price negotiation

Medicine	Original price (THB)	Reduced price (THB)	Potential saving (THB per year)
Tenofovir	43	12	375 million
Pegylate interferon alpha-2a (180 mcg)	9,241	3,150	600 million
Oxaliplatin (injection mg/25 ml)	50 8,000	2,500	152 million

Using Purchasing price in 2009 as basic price

ltem	Saving (Bht)
ARV Non CL	5328.59 million Bht (177.61 million USD)
ARV CL	10165.19 million Bht (353.84 million USD)
J2 and Clopidogrel	6830.37 million Bht (227.68million USD)
Flu vaccine	266.47 million Bht (8.88 million USD)



Journal of Evidence, Training and Quality in Health Care



Volume 108, Issue 7 , 2014, pages 397-404

What is the contribution of health-related evaluations to decision-making in healthcare? Experiences from 7 selected countries

main emphasis

The use of economic evaluation for the pharmaceutical industry in Thailand

Cost-benefit assessments as an instrument for establishing the list of medicines to be reimbursed in Thailand

Yot Teerawattananon 1 ,Nattha tritasavitol 1. 📥 🔤 , Netnapis Suchonwanich 2 ,Pritaporn Kingkaew 1

With in 5 years implementation: Saving 768 million USD



HTA in Vietnam with iDSI: Health benefit package reform

- Almost 80% of the Vietnam Social Security reimbursement budget were on ineffective or costineffective medicines.
- iDSI supported rapid review of HBP to identify potential savings of VND 3,335bn (US\$147m) each year without reducing health outcomes.



Source: Policy brief "Reaching the low-hanging fruits of Vietnam's Health Benefit Package reform", March, 2017



- Study led to
 specification of
 indications for use of
 medicines in health
 facilities.
- Anonymised results reported as a book chapter in What's In, What's Out for reference of other countries that may wish to apply approach.

iDSI Better decisions. Better health.

International Decision Support Initiative

iDSI History

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence



Priority-Setting in Health Building institutions for smarter public spending

A report of the Center for Global Development's Priority-Setting Institutions for Global Health Working Group

> E Center 호 Global Development

Amanda Glassman and Kalipso Chalkidou, Co-chairs

iDSI has worked intensively with seven countries and accelerated HTA in a further four



iDSI has helped 7 countries (South Africa, Ghana, India, China, Philippines, Indonesia and Vietnam) **make tangible institutional progress towards embedding HTA into national health priority-setting**, UHC health benefits package (HBP) design and listing, and commodity procurement

4 countries (Kenya, Tanzania, Zambia, Bhutan) have made early progress in laying institutional foundations for HTA

iDSI empowers governments to provide accessible, cost-effective PHC

Uniquely building HTA and health economics applied capacity for the long term



In **Ghana**, an iDSI costeffectiveness review of hypertension drugs has equipped the government with greater negotiating powers.

A 10% price reduction, to be in line with UK generics pricing, could save over US\$5.6m – enough to treat untreated patients 4x over.

The government has now endorsed an HTA strategy to ensure long-term sustainability of the insurance fund.

iDSI has supported the institutionalisation of HTA in China



"The long-term collaboration between CNHDRC and iDSI... is highly valued by CNHDRC... One senior member described the relationship as 'growing up together', and mutual learning over time... a mutually beneficial and supportive partnership." **iDSI Country Learning Review, China** (2018) The **China National Health Development Research Center** (CNHDRC), thinktank of the National Health Commission and iDSI core partner, is a key agent for strengthening evidence-based decision making in China.

With iDSI's ongoing support, CNHDRC has established a National HTA Center to serve the **newly formed National Health Commission**.

CNHDRC is developing **HTA methods** for the Essential Drugs List (EDL), including the evaluation of drug procurement, clinical usage, pricing and reimbursement.

Given the huge pharmaceuticals market worth \$108bn (2015) – 40% more than all other LMICs combined – **the potential for efficiency** gains translating into health outcomes is enormous.

Knowledge Products and influencing global health policy



Guide to Economic Analysis and Research (GEAR) Online Resource

WHAT'S IN WHAT'S OUT

Designing Benefits for Universal Health Coverage





The International Decision Support Initiative

Health Technology Assessment Toolkit

Set the scene for HTA
Make HTA an inclusive process
Ensure political commitment

Compile the best HTA evidence
 Build capacity to support HTA
 Set up a transparent and consistent process





iDSI today





iDSI: Delivering value and impact for health systems

We work in partnership with countries to build long-term institutional capacity for evidence-informed priority-setting and sustainable universal health coverage (UHC).

- Diverse global delivery network with access to health, economics, health technology assessment (HTA), policy, and capacity-building expertise
- Strong government backing from UK, Thailand, and China for North-South and South-South partnerships
- Extensive and practical policy experience of priority setting in UHC systems





iDSI - Who we are: Core Partners



Imperial College London





KEMRI Wellcome Trust



CLINTON HEALTH ACCESS INITIATIVE





Plus global & regional collaborators including:



What do we do?



Our approach





Advisory Board Members

- Dr Solange Hakiba Deputy Director, Rwanda Social Security Board
- **Dr Martha Gyansa-Lutterodt** Director of Pharmaceutical Services and Chief Pharmacist, Ministry of Health, Ghana
- Dr Bruno Meessen Project Director, The Collectivity
- **Dr Somil Nagpal** Senior Health Specialist, Health, Nutrition and Population Global Practice, World Bank
- Dr Damian Walker Deputy Director of Data and Analytics, Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation
- **Dr Nicole Spieker** Director of East Africa, PharmAccess
- Dr Suwit Wibulpolprasert Senior Health Advisor, Ministry of Health Thailand, Vice Chair HiTAP/National Health Foundation
- Dr Ole Frithjof Professor, Department of Global Public Health and Primary Care, University of Bergen

...including in poorer economies... (cont.)

5.14.3. Policy Statements "The government will improve adequate knowledge in health technology assessment (HTA) for evidence based selection of quality and safe technology as well as realizing value for money." National Health Policy 2017



- "Define an evidence-based benefit package for Kenyans under Universal Health Coverage: (A list of services that should be prioritized and made available taking into account the cost effectiveness, impact on financial protection, and equity in access across the population).
- Define a framework for institutionalization of Health Technology Assessment (HTA)." Cabinet Secretary, Government Gazette, July 2018



TANZANIA HEALTH TECHNOLOGY ASSESSMENT **COMMITTEE (THTAC)** The aim of the Tanzanian Health Technology

Assessment Committee (THTAC) is to make evidenceinformed recommendations to the MOHCDGEC based on the internationally recognized HTA framework. The committee will make recommendations about the public provision of health technologies that will contribute to maintaining and improving the health and well-being of Tanzanians, provide value for money and lead to the ultimate goal of Universal Health Care." **Committee Chaired by CMO and reports to** Secretary, ToRs, 2018



- National Health Summit 2018 plan "MOH should develop a transition plan to ensure sustainable financing and operational management of the supply chain to transition to a government led supply chain system MOH should establish a National Pricing Committee for Medicines
 - MOH should institutionalise Health Technology Assessment to provide

technical advice to the NPC"



...and in richer ones across the EU who use HTA to decide listing and pricing of new technologies... (cont.)



"The outcome of HTA is used to inform decisions concerning the allocation of budgetary resources in the field of health, for example, in relation to establishing the pricing or reimbursement levels of health technologies. HTA can therefore assist Member States in creating and maintaining sustainable healthcare systems and to stimulate innovation that delivers better outcomes for patients" **REGULATION OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL on health technology assessment and amending**

REGULATION OF THE EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT AND OF THE COUNCIL on health technology assessment and amending Directive 2011/24/EU

Published outcomes

Branded Name	Company ²	Therapeutic Area	Year	НТА Туре
Lojuxta	Aegerion	Hyper-cholesterolemia	2015	Belgium re-used Ducth HTA work
Orkambi	Vertex	Cystic fibrosis	2016	First submission – Joint HTA (Belgium and Netherlands); external referee (Dutch Zorginstituut); Luxembourg used final report
Praluent	Sanofi	Dyslipidemias	2016	External referee (Dutch Zorginstituut for Belgium)
Orkambi	Vertex	Cystic fibrosis	2017	Second submission - Joint HTA (Belgium Netherlands); external referee (Dutch Zorginstituut); final report sent to Luxembourg and Austria
Vyndaqel	Pfizer	Amyloidosis	2017	External referee (Dutch Zorginstituut for Belgium); Luxembourg used final report
Ocaliva	Intercept	Primary biliary cholangitis	2018	Joint HTA (Belgium and Netherlands)
Spinraza	Biogen	Spinal Muscular Atrophy	2018	Joint HTA (Belgium and Netherlands) ³
impact (such as United Kingdom). Of the 45 countries surveyed, 34 have at least one HTA agency in place, primarily in the public sector."			HORIZON SCANNING	HTA HTA RICING AND CLINICAL MONITORING DISINVESTMENT

Systematic assessment of value can make **private** markets work better





"Standards of care, evidence-based • treatment protocols and processes for conducting [HTA] to assess the impact, efficacy and costs of medical technology, medicines and devices relative to clinical outcomes must be developed. Findings... should be published to stimulate competition in the market, to **mitigate information** asymmetry, and to inform decisions about strategic purchasing by the public and private sectors."



"The current government system of JKN does not link the clinical and economic assessment of drugs for price negotiation and tariff setting, which can lead to cost-effective drugs not being available to providers at an affordable rate (or conversely, the reimbursement rate not accounting for the market price of this drug)... The price-quantity negotiation process should... reflect the HTAs/Economic Assessment results more broadly beyond certain high-price but low-volume top-up drugs, reflecting the affordability and cost-effectiveness thresholds that Indonesia wants to set...'

And even in the USA private insurers and pharmaceutical benefits managers adopt HTA...

CVS adopting VBP based on ICER estimates



~\$145K average annual price of the last three approved oral oncology drugs

Sources: CVS Specialty analysis of Medispan data. Annual drug costs based on average wholesale price (AWP) accessed December 2017 CVS Specialty Analytics. Drug launch cost based on wholesale acquisition cost (WAC) launch pricing accessed Spring 2018

- "CVS Caremark is initiating a program that allows clients to exclude any drug launched at a price of greater than \$100,000 per QALY from their plan. The QALY ratio is determined based on publicly available analyses from the Institute for Clinical and Economic Review (ICER), an organization skilled in the development of comparative effectiveness analyses.
- Medications deemed "breakthrough" therapies by the U.S. Food and Drug Administration will be excluded from this program, which will focus on expensive, "me-too" medications that are not cost effective, helping put pressure on manufacturers to reduce launch prices to a reasonable level."

October 2018: China launches HTA and launches National Centre of Medicine and Health Technology Assessment



FU WeI Director-General, Research Fellow, China National Health Development Research Center, National Health Commission

FU Wei once served as Consultant, Director and Deputy Director of the former Division of Primary Health and Maternal and Child Care, the Department of Rural Health Management, the Department of Maternal and Child Health and Community Health, and the Medical Reform Office of the Ministry of Health, as well as Deputy Director of the Department of Healthcare Reform office of the State Council). Other social posts includes: Vice Prevident of the China Health Economics Association, Chairman of the Health Expenditure and Policy Committee, Chairman of the Application Faviluation and Protection Committee of Chinase Health Information and Big Data Association, Chairman of China Health Policy and Technology Assessment Research Network Committee, and Director of the Collaborative Center for Term Classifications and Standarks of the World Health Organization.

4. Knowledge translation and Decision Making

- Pricing Negotiation for 18 Generic Cancer Drug
- Updating National Essential Drug List
- Comprehensive Drug Assessment
- Reviewing Public Health Service Package
- Setting Up the List of Appropriate Technologies in County Level Hospitals



"We have fully utilized HTA...to balance financially sustainability and access to new cancer drugs...up to 30% price reductions compared to nearby countries" *Director of Chinese Medical Insurance Bureau, Beijing, October 2018*



(二)完善目录调整管理机制。优化基本药物目录遴选调整程序,综合药品临床应用实践、药品标 准变化、药品新上市情况等因素,对基本药物目录定期评估、动态调整,调整周期原则上不超过3年。 对新审批上市、疗效较已上市药品有显著改善且价格合理的药品,可适时启动调入程序。坚持调入和 调出并重,优先调入有效性和安全性证据明确、成本效益比显著的药品品种;重点调出已退市的,发 生严重不良反应较多、经评估不宜再作为基本药物的,以及有风险效益比或成本效益比更优的品种替 代的药品。原则上各地不增补药品,少数民族地区可增补少量民族药。

2018年全国药政工作会在京召开明确加快短缺药品供应保障体系建设等7项重点 发布时间:2018-10-15

10月15日,2018年全国药政工作会议在京召开。明确近期我国药政工作将着力围绕加快短缺药品 供应保障体系建设、全面实施国家基本药物制度新政策、全面落实药品采购"两票制"、提高药品供应 保障能力、开展药品临床综合评价、推进国家药物政策体系和协调机制建设等7个方面重点展开。

China 4+7 cities procurement reforms

HEALTH NEWS



Japan: using HTA for pricing adjustments...

• The new HTA process will include medical drugs and devices, and will exclude products used solely for rare diseases (where there are no current treatments), or used solely for paediatric diseases.

• The standard assessment route will use a QALY threshold of JPY5million, after which price premiums will be progressively reduced (by up to 90%) until the threshold of JPY10million.

• The special assessment route, for products with rare disease, paediatric or anti-cancer indications, will use QALY thresholds that are 50% higher.

Decision processes for re-pricing adjustment



Prof Kamae Isao



15/10/201



JICA: Japan's HTA helping the world achieve UHC!



GHIT / Fund

Global Health Innovative Technology Fund

"We facilitate international partnerships that bring Japanese innovation, investment, and leadership to the global fight against infectious diseases and poverty in the developing world." "Our vision is one in which the crushing burden of infectious disease no longer prevents billions of people in the developing world from seeking the level of prosperity and longevity now common in the industrialized world."

https://www.unitingeffortsforhealth.org/









Uniting Efforts for Innovation, Access and Delivery is a new global platform – launched in 2019 by the core partners the Government of Japan, the UNDP-led Access and Delivery Partnership (ADP) and the GHIT Fund – that aims to bring together and promote dialogue among key stakeholders to accelerate and improve the innovation, access and delivery of medicines, vaccines, diagnostics and other health technologies for unmet health needs in low- and middle-income countries.



HTA in Japan: maximising the potential!

Anchor price for Align with professional procurement/pricing of STGs, Clinical Pathways single source products Inform listing/pricing in and provider reimbursement insurance schemes Pre-emptively manage supply side/industry in Defend tough decisions a controlled and to the people and the **Boost domestic R&D** regulated setting professional through rigorous community. evaluation culture showing value added. Generate global public goods in the form of **Strengthen Japanese** analyses for other academe raising global payers to use. profile.

"Raising sufficient money for health is imperative, but just having the money will not ensure universal coverage. Nor will removing financial barriers to access through prepayment and pooling. The final requirement is to ensure resources are used efficiently."

10 World Health Report on financing for universal coverage



Better decisions. Better health.

kalipso.chalkidou@gmail.com